## Impact of Interfaith Dialogue on Pakistani Society (A Critical Analysis of Modern Interreligious Dialogue Movement)

Riaz Ahmad Saeed

Lecturer Department of Islamic Studies, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad

#### **Abstract**

The previous century is historically counted as most remarkable period for the promotion of interfaith dialogue and other interreligious activities among the followers of different faiths. Numerous interreligious activities were introduced to bring closer the followers of defriends religions. Many Christian as well as Muslim organizations are actively involved in these activities. New interfaith dialogue movement was launched by Vatican City with many Christian institutes in second half of 20<sup>th</sup> century. In this context we cannot ignore role of the Christian Study Centers situated across the globe, which are providing considerable services in the field of interfaith dialogue. One of them is Christian Study Centre Rawalpindi (CSC), Pakistan. The CSC is considered as the representative of this modern interfaith dialogue movement in Pakistan. Keeping in view, it has long journey in the course of interfaith dialogue, peace and harmony since its commencement in 1968. It is also noticed; this activity of dialogue is influencing the Muslim and Christian communities of Pakistan both positively and negatively in the fields of politics, social and religious matters. We observe, in one hand, the positive impacts of these dialogical activities are excellent contribution to improve mutual understanding, tolerance and respect towards minorities, to protect their rights, to support interfaith and social harmony, promotion of peaceful co-existence, while, on the other hand, it shows some negative impact as well. These may include unification of religions, promotion of secularism, struggle against Islamic laws, and Islamic identity of Pakistan and spread of missionary activities. It is also observed; Muslim scholars say warm welcome to positive contribution of this dialogue but show their strong reservations for negative side of such dialogue. This study explores the positive as well as negative impact of modern interfaith dialogue movement on Muslim community of Pakistan at social, religious and political level.

**Keywords**: Interfaith dialogue, impact, modern dialogue movement, Pakistani context, critical study.

**INTRODUCTION:** The 20<sup>th</sup> century is considered as the most notable era for the promotion of interfaith dialogue and other interreligious activities among different religious communities. Many interfaith activities were launched to

bring closer different faiths, specially, the adherents of Abrahamic faiths: Jews, Christians and Muslims. For this purpose, the foremost initiative was taken by Christians on the behalf of Vatican with the collaboration of Muslim scholars, in 1950s. Thus, Johan Esposito said;

"The (modern interfaith) dialogue movement began during the 1950s when the WCC (World Council of Churches) and the Vatican (City) organized a number of meetings between Christian leaders and representatives of other religious traditions (especially, with Muslim and Buddhist communities)".

This is also an overlooked fact that Muslims have a long history of interacting with Christians. The Oxford Islamic Encyclopedia specified, "Muslim-Christian dialogue dates back to the rise of Islam in the seventh century. The History of Muslim-Christian interactions includes periods of great tension, hostility and open war and a time of uneasiness, and also, peaceful coexistence and cooperation." Therefore, many Christian's as well as Muslims institutes, organizations and movements have been actively involved in such activities. The key role of the seven Christians Study Centers in different parts of the world cannot be ignored in the promotion of interfaith dialogue.

These Global Christian Study Centers have been the well-known ecumenical centers, which are working worldwide for Muslim-Christian relations, interreligious dialogue, interfaith harmony and projection of Christian causes in Islamic world. Dr. Karen J. D. counts them in the Research Journal, al-*Mushīr* likewise;

"1-Christian Study Centre Rawalpindi, Pakistan, 2-Henry Martyn Institute Hyderabad, India, 3-The Centre *d'Etudes Dioce'sain, Algier*, 4-The Institute des Belles Letters Arabasm, Tunis,5-The Institute Dominicaind 'Etudes Orientals, Cairo,(Egypt), 6-An Institute *de'AtudesIslamo Chrestiens*, Beirut,(Lebanon) and 7-Universite' *Pontificale: Vidyajyot*, Delhi, India."

Keeping in mind, they are well-managed and interlinked with each other. An interesting thing is, all CSCs are situated in the Muslim Countries except for India (in India, Muslim population is also more than 2 billons) and they work without any obstacle and hurdle. These centers have a long history to promote Muslim Christian relations, dialogue, harmony and Christian mission around the world. Therefore, Dr. Jacques Levrat (A French Christian Scholar) writes about status of these Christian study centers in his doctoral study likewise; "The study Centers are institutions which are established in Muslim Countries by a Christian community for pursuing studies which prepare that community for cultural and religious dialogue with Muslims".

It is also observed that the CSC, Rawalpindi (Pakistan) is one of the distinguished 'ecumenical' Christian institute in Pakistan and known as an

Volume 6, Issue 1

extension of HMI (Henry Martyn Institute)<sup>6</sup> established in 1930 in the British India at Lahore (Punjab). After the Partition of the subcontinent in 1947, it was shifted to Indian Hyderabad. Moreover, the Christian Study Centre is measured as an extension of HMI in Pakistani. It is also known; when HMI was shifted from Pakistan to India it was considered that CSC would replace the HMI dialogical activities in Pakistan. The Christian Study Centre has been working for the past several years for a special cause in the Pakistani society. According to the CSC approach this mission holds interfaith dialogue and to promote religious and social harmony, peace and peaceful coexistence in Pakistan. A Newsletter of the Christian Study Center tells us about its contribution in interfaith dialogue likewise;

"The Christian study Centre, for the past 40 years with holding of interfaith dialogical meetings, national and international seminars and the publishing of research papers is trying to promote the peace mission."

The Chastain Study Centre is affecting the Pakistani Muslim society from the many years in a leisurely but steady way. The core problem is that how the CSC does influences our society and what positive and negative impact of these activities may have on Pakistani society? In the following pages, we will try to respond these questions. We will try to evaluate the political, social and religious impact of the dialogical activities of the CSC. In this Study we shall adopt both theoretical and Practical to evaluate the impact and effects of modern interfaith dialogue movement with special reference to Pakistani society. Moreover, we divide the impact into both positive and negative. First, we shall discuss the positive impact, then the negative one. Hopefully, this study opens new horizon to understand and promote the interfaith dialogue in Muslim countries.

#### POSITIVE IMPACTS OF DIALOGUE ON PAKISTANI SOCIETY:

It is a well-known fact that the CSC is basically an interfaith dialogue institute. Thus, its first and major influence should be on faith and religion. A Research report cum book of the Center speaks, "The basic purpose of establishing the Christian study Centre Rawalpindi was to promote interfaith dialogue for a peaceful society where the people feel respect and tolerance to each other." This journey does not stop here but as well as, it has extended its scope in discipline of interreligious dialogue, socio-religious harmony, mutual respect and interfaith tolerance for different situations. Here, Prof. Yusuf *Jalīl* point should be noted.

"We feel an obligation to help make possible a wider spirit and practice of dialogue in our communities. We recognize that different situations call for different sensitivities, but that certain irreducible principles should be respected. The implications of these principles will be particular to various contexts and will need to be patiently and potentially."

It is perceived that the CSC dialogue is practically a socio-political dialogue. Therefore, we observe that the social and political track of Chastain and Muslim interreligious dialogue is also an vital goal of the CSC. We do not forget this fact that the religious and social and moral teachings of the Christian faith are close to one another, therefore they explore faith in its historical, cultural, and social context. It can be recited in the initial aims of the Center, "To study the local culture: in particular to study and interpret the faith of Muslims and Christians and their relationship both past and present." We know that the CSC is not in an actual sense a political institution as well as the political activities is not from its core agenda but at that times, it gets involvement in the political events for its own benefits and so on it affect the politics and the constitution of the prevailing Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Therefore, it can be assumed the CSC interreligious and social harmony dialogue has some political, spiritual and communal, as well impact on Pakistani Muslims and Christians communities both. Some Pakistani scholars agree while some other disagree that the CSC has political involvement and impact on the Pakistani society. Here, Maulāna Maqsûd Salfi rightly specified, "The CSC dialogue has very deep social and political impact on Pakistani Muslim and Christian community." 11 As well as Mr. Mehbûb Sadā a wellknown Pakistani Christian leader and ex Director of CSC articulated about the socio-political impacts of the center in meeting;

"This dialogue has clear political impact in Pakistan. When in Pakistan there was separate electoral system, the Pakistani nation was divided into many blocks and the political leadership reached so late on different occasions for Christians, but now the situation is different because Christian has also a vote as Muslims and all Pakistani Muslims and non–Muslims are a one nation."

The legislation about the minorities is an active agenda and necessary part of the Christian and Muslims interfaith dialogue in the Islamic state of Pakistan. Thus, *Qāzī Abdul Qadīr Khāmûsh* supposed, "The present legislation in Pakistan, especially, for separate electoral system in Pakistan is a part of this Muslim-Christian dialogue movement and this is a great success for this movement in Pakistan." Therefore, it seems better to introduce the positive as well as notorious religious, social and political impacts and effects of the Centre's interreligious cum social dialogue.

Mutual understanding and interfaith respect is the most vital impact of the CSC's interfaith dialogue events. It is hereby stated that the leading administration of the CSC counts it as their important purposes of the interreligious dialogue in Pakistan. We also recite a number of enjoyable stories and occurrences in the past 50 year's academic and administrative account of the Center, which also illustrate how misconstruction among Christian and Muslims communities of the Pakistani Muslim society can be

finished. We study in a publication, the story of a media correspondent, who went to discover some anti-state plan in an NGO meeting. He says, "The program started with these words, respectable members and guests, we shall begin with the customary recital from the Holy Quran, these words were like a sweet music to my ears and my disillusionment automatically cleared up. This beautiful utterance was attributed to a Christian lady Cristina Peter, who had invited a little girl on the dais for the recitation of Holy Quran, while standing respectfully with arms folded. This was unbelievable for me."<sup>14</sup> He more says, this was a summit of an NGO on regional level in a famous Christian Church. Prior to it, he was against NGOs, but after it, his impression changed. He says, to tell you the truth, I was dazed. I was here to look for news regarding the next plan of action from the enemies of my country, but instead, I had known that the traditions of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (مليه being discoursed. There was a discussion of love, friendliness, peace, harmony and prosperity, and other human values which had been grabbed from us several years before due to some reasons. The Quran and Islam were being communicated there. This was the moment when my views acquired an intense turn and the preconsidered hate for the NGOs, which had been constructed up in my emotion, demolish with a crash." 15 Mr. Shāhid-Islam likes it as a true story and a wonderful example of the Mutual understanding, interfaith respect and a good illustration to eliminate the fallacies between Muslims and Christians communities of the Pakistan society. It can be understood from the above discourse that the basic objectives of the CSC have to promote interfaith respect and mutual understanding among different faiths and communities of the Pakistan Muslim society, especially among Muslims and Christians of Pakistan.

Interfaith harmony and tolerance is another most important impact of the CSC dialogical activities in Pakistan. We read in a publication of the CSC: According to the ex-director of the CSC, Mr. Mehbûb Sadā; "The interfaith harmony is considered as an important prerequisite of the time. Today, in the current situation of Pakistan, we feel its further need. The Christian study Centre is involved in this activity for past many years (since 1968)."<sup>16</sup> They conducted many pilot projects for this important purpose. The project coordinator comments, "Interfaith and social harmony project is a project which is run under the supervision of the Christian Study Centre". We observe the clear fruits of these events that a group of scholars from Christians and Muslims feel the requirement of interreligious and social harmony in Pakistani society and this is counted their excellent success in pure traditional Muslim society. To endorse the awareness of interfaith diversity and pluralism among different communities and religions a reserved Muslim society of Pakistan is a most significant mission of the Center. The training plan of interreligious cum social harmony project goes to this issue, "How can

we promote the respect for the diversity of ideas in a society? So that the people accept each other and accept this thing that diversity is not a bad thing." At another place, it is said: "The beauty and charm of the world is in diversity, not in uniformity. It means that the base of peace is in 'Unity in Diversity'." Thus, we perceive that the establishment of a multicultural society in Pakistan is a basic aim of the CSC. Furthermore, according to the CSC's projects and planning, a diverse thought is compulsory for a peace and peaceful coexistence in any society, especially in Pakistan.

The administration of the CSC has a record of various events and stories in favor of their claim that this program carries on positively for the true dimension and direction. We may recite in their academic documentations, "A very good seminar was conducted by the CSC with the collaboration of a peace partner organization, FLAME (Family Life and Maternity Education) in the hub of intolerance and crises, Shantī Nagger<sup>20</sup>, Sanglā Hill (District Nankāna) Punjab. In this tense situation, the CSC tried to remove the clashes and conflicts with its social and peace activities. To conduct a peace seminar was the chain of these steps. After the seminar, a well-known local lawyer stood up and said, "They confess that this incident is a stigma on the peaceful city of Sangla Hill and this is the first incident in the history of the city. But we assure you this will be the last incident and the people will live together peacefully in the days to come. Moreover, we suggest that a peace poll should be erected in the city as a symbol of unity between Muslims and Christians."21 The administration of the Center presents it as a bright example in the favor of interfaith diversity and pluralism in Pakistani society. Furthermore, the CSC claims for an energetic role to eliminate the conflictions between Muslim and Christian community of Sangla Hill Shantī Nager. According to the statement of the CSC's representatives, this is their first priority to come close and remove the misinterpretations and misapprehension among different faiths and traditions, especially, between the popular religious communities of Christians and Muslims. At that point, a renowned traditional Muslim Scholar Sayed *Izhār Bukhārī* said in an interview, "Due to the CSC interfaith dialogue, good relationship is increasing between Muslims and Christians."<sup>22</sup> Accordingly, these were some brief examples of the positive faith based influences and effects of the CSC's interreligious dialogical events and activities, harmony & mutual relations. It seems they are trying to promote a tolerant and diverse society for good interfaith relations, but their efforts cannot prove more We see some serious conflicts and misunderstandings between Muslims and Christians of Pakistan. According to the researcher's humble opinion, there is an active need to support awareness between Christians and Muslim communities of Pakistan on faith basis that they would respect each other with religious sprit and feelings. We suggest that this will be possible when we shall discuss common religious issue in our dialogue.

Another most positive impact of the CSC's dialogue is promotion of Peaceful co-existence in Pakistani society. This important issue is a part of every interreligious dialogue and key objectives of the CSC. An ex CSC director's comments most likely in this regard, "One of the most important purposes of the Christian study Centre's dialogue is peace and peaceful coexistence among religious and social communities of Pakistan."<sup>23</sup>Although, they have their own definition of peace and peaceful coexistence, but they are trying to promote peaceful society in Pakistan, because peace is one of the most important topics of the Bible and the Quran both. According to a Christian research scholar opinion, "The message of love, reconciliation and peace is found in the Holy Bible from beginning (The Book of Genesis) to the end (The Book of revelation)."<sup>24</sup> Many a time, the Holy Quran considers peace and peaceful coexistence as a key feature and basic need of a civilized human society. Therefore, we observe the efforts for reconciliation, peacemaking and peaceful co-existence on national and international level from Christian and Muslim communities frequently and uninterruptedly. The Christian Study Center's team has set many examples of peaceful co-existence in Pakistani society. By means of this we hear an excellent story in their very good collection of, "True stories of joyful co-existence". A Christian religious leader, Father Rehmat Raja pronounces a joyful story of peaceful social cooperation in his research paper in the title of Praim Nagar (The village of Love). The story tells, "We are the residents of Military Farm Chak No. 4-L/13, in District Okara (Punjab). In 1995 my mother died and I was in Lahore in a Program. When I reached my village, the elder of the village (Numberdār) and other Muslims of the Village participated in my mother's last funeral ceremony (Memorial Service). This is to keep in mind that in this village, our one family is Christian. The Muslims participate in our ceremonies and we participate in the Muslim ceremonies. Even on the occasions of  $E\bar{\imath}d$  and Easter we say happy  $E\bar{i}d$  and happy Easter to each other. The Christian help Muslims and Muslims help Christian in any trouble. At times, when our father had no money for our education, the elder of the Village (Numberdār) paid our fee dues and due to this, I could get higher education from abroad. In our Village, there is no difference on the basis of religion. We have active social terms and relations with Muslims and the Muslims with us."25 Accordingly, Father Rehmat Ali Raja considers this story an excellent example of peaceful mutual living and cooperation between Muslims and Christians comminutes of Pakistan in that Village. Instead of this behavior some Christians do not satisfy with Pakistani Muslims and say that we have no right in Pakistan. I think it is not true because facts don't support it.

To establish Good cooperation between Muslims and Christians is another most vital influence of Christian and Muslim interreligious dialogue in Pakistani socio-religious context. To promote environment of mutual cooperation between Christian and Muslims communities of Pakistani and

jointly attempt to solve different social and religious problems is a valuable success of the CSC. Keeping in view, their main focus is on social issues and to try to promote social justice and peace between both faiths in a Pakistani society. Here, Mr Sadā speaks rationally. He stated frequently in a meeting, "I think, to promote peace and justice in Pakistan is a basic purpose of the establishing of the Christian Study Centre, Rawalpindi."26 We grasp several examples of societal and religious cooperation in Pakistani society between Muslim and Christian in different scopes of life. For example Muslims and Christians are jointly working for education, peace, tolerance, social justice and society development etc. A substantial number of Muslims are attached with the CSC in their dialogue activities in Pakistan. There are many examples of Muslim-Christian cooperation on social issues; one of them is as following. Mr. Tariq *Hamīd* described this story, "26/M is a remote village of *Dunyāpur* District Vehārī, lying between Khānīwāl and Bahawalpur (Punjab). The poverty stricken people work in the fields. It is a backward area, consisting of a few Muslim settlements. The majority is Christians. Despite having stayed together for such a long time, their social terms are not healthy. The Muslims of this area had no warm social relations with Christians. Our Organization (FDO: Farmers Development Organization) is working towards aiding the farmers. We organized the programs regardless of caste, color, or creed, which include farmers, field-laborers and workers. Our work is to aid and assist them regarding the tips and techniques for making progress. He further said, The Christian community collaborated in building a school for children. The Christian children went to school but the Muslim parents did not send their Children to this School due to some religious causes. One day, I managed the program to ask *Maulavī* Sahib of the village regarding this situation. I said to him that he should appeal to the Muslim community to send their children to the school. But Maulavī Sahib rejected my proposal. Then I presented him a letter, but he said to me, "I do not know English as you know. Then, I said, if we do not teach our children, they will remain ignorant and will keep playing in the ground of this village generation to generation. Then Maulavī Sahib agreed with me and we named the school Saint (Mother) Teresa<sup>27</sup> School, The next day Maulavī sahib gave a lecture on the importance of education and appealed to the Muslim families to send their children to that school. The next year, I saw ten names of Muslim children in the school admission register. The social and religious relations are also very good between the Christian and Muslim communities with this good beginning". 28 This is a decent example of mutual cooperation of both faiths on social issues like education. In addition, in these days, Muslims' cooperation with the Christian and other NGOs can be seen in every field of life but the question is that why Muslims did not cooperate with Christian and other NGOs in these social and religious activities. We think, the core reason is their missionary activities and some NGO's will be also found involve in serious anti-state activities. Some of them

are also bounded and sanctioned from Home Ministry of Pakistan in these years. This paper may not describe them as whole.

Separate electoral system is another main influence and success of this social cum interfaith dialogue on Pakistani political system. During the Government of president general Zia-ul-Haq the joint electoral system was implemented in Pakistan in 1980s. The Pakistani Christians community did not admit it till now. They constantly struggled against this political system and at last succeeded in General Pervaiz Musharraf's government in 2002 after 22 years. Pakistani Christian community considers it as a great success in their political struggle. Director of the CSC *Mehbûb Sadā* stated;

"This was a great success of the CSC and other brother Christian organizations and a good example of political impact of the CSC dialogue in Pakistan. Mr. *Mehbûb Sadā* further said about the six Christian organizations (COSAP<sup>29</sup>), which struggled continuously against the joint electoral system and finally in 2002, the separate electoral system was implemented."<sup>30</sup>

The CSC counts it a valuable example of political impact of this interreligious cum social dialogue in Pakistani context. Moreover, this becomes a big success in an ideological Muslim state.

Therefore, it can be said a positive kind of political responsiveness in Pakistani minorities is increasing day by day due to this modern interfaith dialogue movement. The CSC discusses the significant issues related to Pakistani Christians' role in national and the international level in their dialogue seminars and conferences. They trained their community for that purpose in their special projects and workshops. For that purpose, a very good seminar was held on the topic of "Religion and Democracy in Pakistan: A Dialogue of Perspective". An annual report of the CSC speaks on this seminar, "This two day seminar on, Religion and Democracy Pakistan: A Dialogue of Perspectives was held in the month of August, 1997 to celebrate the Golden Jubilee of Pakistan with special reference to Christian participation in freedom movement."31 It is keenly observed; in these seminars they focus on Christians' contribution and services in the development and progress of Pakistan and freedom movement. To project the importance of the minorities and their rights is really a most important political influence of this modern dialogue movement in Pakistani perspective. Here, Mr. Qāzī Abdul Qadīr Khāmûsh assumed in an official meeting on dialogue, "Due to Muslim-Christian dialogue we understand minorities' rights and their importance in Pakistan."<sup>32</sup> Definitely, the positive awareness about Pakistani minorities and their legal, social and religious rights is increasing in Pakistani socio-religious and political context due to this dialogue, which is a positive change.

The center also gives highly significance to political activities and special legislation regarding minorities in Pakistani legal and political

perspective. They keep view on political change in Pakistani society and try to get benefit from it according to their needs. Here, we may realize importance of minorities in Pakistani politics and legislation due to double vote system. They feel more protection and security due to this legislation. Again  $Q\bar{a}z\bar{i}$ Abdul Qadīr Khāmûsh tolled in an interview, "Due to separate electoral system, they have become important in Pakistani election and the politicians give them much importance during election because they have double vote in Pakistan.<sup>33</sup> This shows that importance and influence of minorities is increasing in Pakistani political system and society which is good news for minorities and for solution of their social, political and religious issues. Therefore, it can be observed in this way the present interreligious cum social dialogical activities are affecting social and political system in Pakistani context. Specially, the right to double vote and special right to separate electoral system are considered great successes of the Christian minority in a constantly declared Islamic state, like Pakistan. Any minority including Muslims of this globe cannot think in any other country to avail it even in secular west.

# SOME NOTORIOUS IMPACT DRAWBACKS OF DIALOGUE IN PAKISTAN:

If we analyze critically the Christian Study Centre's dialogue, we also see some undesirable religious, social and political impact of this modern movement of interfaith dialogue in Pakistani Islamic context, because it is assumed on valid arguments that they are not working only for interreligious dialogue but they are also promoting their some special goals and efforts. A renowned known Pakistani Christian leader cum scholar Fr. James Channan stated the need of this dialogue in Pakistan in Christian perspective likewise, "There is a need to help our people realize that a dialogue with Muslims is must in Pakistan. There is no future for the church in Pakistan without dialogue."34Accordingly we may understand their active attention and participation in modern interreligious dialogue movement in Pakistani context. In other words it is a contemporary tool of Christian missionary and evangelical activities in Worldwide and especially in third world Muslim countries. We recite this core objective of modern dialogue in an international Journal of *Missiolgy*, "Dialogue in its very nature is a missionary activity. It is, to Catholic Church, a means to expand the mission of Christ and lead the people to eternal salvation by converting them to Christianity."<sup>35</sup>Due to these reasons, the Muslims public and scholars do not agree with this kind of interfaith dialogue. This activity damages the cause of interfaith dialogue in Pakistan and over the world.

They very well know these issues and discuss them in their private gatherings. Sometimes they depict it openly. We explores this discussion in a dialogue of peace, "Most of our companions do not know the actual spirit of interfaith dialogue and attach it with a hidden conspiracy or agenda; this is a

great misunderstanding and misconception regarding dialogue and Christian community."<sup>36</sup> It means they are also aware about these issues but they ignore and overlook them for their special interests. The present director *Mehbûb Sadā* also describes this doubt it: "If any person is doubtful about the spirit of dialogue and he does not understand its importance apparently, then he uses its elements in practical dialogue."<sup>37</sup> The most relevant and valid query is that why majority of Muslim scholars do not alike this compassionate of interfaith cum social dialogue and also show their deep reservations. It is also observed the CSC dialogical activities have some negative social impacts because the Christian study Center is not a mere a dialogue organization but it is also an institution of Christian interests and activities. At that point we must study the core objectives of the CSC;

"To assist the Christian church in Pakistan in its attempt at getting a better understanding of its historical background and its existence as a part of universal church and of its particular calling in an Islamic State. It also deeply focuses on the process of *Islamisation* taking place in Pakistan and its impacts on the position of minorities in Pakistan". <sup>38</sup>

Consequently, due to this and some other seen and unseen reasons Muslim scholars have some reservations and see some negative impacts as well as positive.

If we intensively study the socio-political influences of this interfaith dialogue movement, we may openly observe, this interreligious dialogue has some undesirable political effects and positive also in Pakistani Muslim socioreligious context. Therefore, according to some Muslim scholars the CSC is hidden promoting a secular political agenda in Pakistan in the name of interfaith dialogue. As an example we perceive propaganda against Islamic Laws, especially, the Law of Blasphemy, protest and regular Compiegne against Blasphemy Law and Act (295-C), Political black mailing due to double vote and separate electoral system etc. Here, a prominent Muslim scholar and an expert of dialogue Prof. Dr. Imtiāz Zafar showed his concerns in an academic meeting on dialogue, "Sometimes, Pakistani minorities get unnecessary value on some political issues due to their dual vote right."<sup>39</sup> It is not a positive sign in a legally declared ideological Islamic state. The minority's politicians have special interests for their person not for their community. Their religious leaders may do something for community development but political and missionary leadership do not do anything to their community because they are busy to get attraction of Muslim majority. I have also heard discussion about these issues in personal meetings and also in the Christian Study center's programs. Here, I would like to share some most imperative social, political and religious, social undesirable influence of this modern dialogue movement, and then both sides of picture can be seen.

To propagate and spread openly liberalism and secularism in Islamic

republic of Pakistan is most negative social impact of this interfaith dialogical movement. A report of a seminar illustrated;

"Since the creation of Pakistan there has been a long debate in the country whether Pakistan should be a secular or theoretic (Islamic) state? In this background we organized this dialogue between the representatives of various schools of thoughts in the country. This international seminar was held from 10-12<sup>th</sup> December, 1998 at the Christian Study Centre with the collaboration of the Christian Study Centre and Fredrick Neumann- Foundation Islamabad (FNF). 40 participants attended this seminar from all over the country."

It is also a fact Majority of Muslims in Pakistan see the schools, colleges and other theological seminaries as missionary activists and agent to westernization in Pakistan. One of the Christian scholars state Muslim reservations about these institutes in his book. He illustrated:

"The criticism on Christian schools and colleges also voiced. They were in colonial time agencies for evangelization and proselytization and acrid a sigma for Muslims. They hardly engage in such things anymore at least overtly. Missionary schools and colleges are popular and in demand yet some Muslim still see them agents of westernization, preventing their wards becoming loyal to Pakistan and Islam". 41

This fact openly shows the Muslim concerns that the promotion of secularism in Pakistan is the part of their hidden strategy and aims of this dialogue. Prof.  $Q\bar{a}z\bar{\imath}$  Zia-ul-Haq speaks about this key issue, "Interfaith dialogue in itself is a good activity but the modern movement of dialogue has negative impact on Pakistani Muslim society and one of the most important negative impacts of this dialogue is to spread liberalism and secularism in Pakistani Muslim society." The previous statement is an evidence of Muslim misconception about this modern interfaith dialogue. However, if it is so, then it is a question mark on identity of Pakistan, as a legally declared Islamic state.

Majority of the Pakistani Muslim religious scholars ('Ulamā), as well as some social scholars counted it as an additional adverse influence of this interreligious dialogue movement. Actually, it is the deliberate struggle to eliminate dismissal or change the Islamic Laws, especially, the law of Blasphemy Act<sup>43</sup> (295-C) in Islamic Republic of Pakistan. It is assumed the minorities especially Christian leaders propagate against the law of Blasphemy on national and international levels on the behalf of secular lobby. Many studies and reports depict that one of the core demands of The Christian community of Pakistan and especially the CSC is to eliminate the Blasphemy Act (295-C). A renowned CSC Resource person Dr. *Aslam Khaki* has articulated in his lectures to Muslim-Christian community in different American based academic institutions about the actual essentials of

interreligious dialogue and harmony in Pakistani Muslim society. He frequently and openly demands, "The controversial laws (Law of Blasphemy) in Pakistan are using to threat the (religious) enemies (minorities), due to this the differences between religions have been increasing."

Due to this leashed propaganda and some other seen and unseen reasons, some notorious NGOs and some secular Muslims are also demanding to dismiss or minimum review this law in Pakistan. We know the Pakistan people's Party and Governor Punjab Selman Tāsīr demanded in his lecture; "The law of Blasphemy (Blasphemy Act, 295-C) should be dismissed from Pakistani constitution and he also said it the black law for minorities."45 According to national newspapers; "All Pakistan Minorities Alliance (APMA) demand to abolish the blasphemy act (295-C in) Pakistan."46 According to BBC urdu.com; "The government of Pakistan is also thinking to change this law of blasphemy (295-C)."47We read and hear this thing in the Christian missionary literature; they say the Blasphemy Act is the scholarly defeat of Muslims in religious perspective. A Muslim magazine reported this issue as, "Due to this (Blasphemy Act 295-C) in Pakistan some priests say that the *Law* of death on the Blasphemy of Prophets and Quran is scholarly defeat of Muslims". 48 But the scholars know that the Blasphemy act was also present in Europe (England) till 19th Century and even today available to protect the Christianity in some aspects. Keeping in view, the Pakistani law of Blasphemy (295-C) is not only for protection of the sanctity of Last Messenger عليه but it is also for the protection of all Prophets (عليه but) but it is also for the protection of all Prophets including Jesus and Moses (صلى الله عليه وسلم).

Moreover, some traditional Muslim scholars have their reservations that this social cum interreligious dialogue movement have become an active forum against Blasphemy and Islamic laws in Pakistan. Maulāna 'Abdulraûf Fārûqi presents his view point regarding this issue likewise; "Modern interfaith dialogue movement in Pakistan is an arranged and active forum and strong efforts against Blasphemy Act and other Islamic Laws under the umbrella of dialogue."<sup>49</sup> Even he wrote a letter to the Pakistani Christian leaders about this sensitive issue, under the title, "An open letter to Pakistani **Church**, with the academic reference of monthly dialogue Magazine *Mukālma* Bayn al-Mazāhib, Lahore. Some studies notices, some secular scholars (Muslim and Christians) demand that the solution of this problem have to dismiss or illuminate the Law of Blasphemy (295-C) because this law harms the minorities' especially Christian community. I think the ground reality is not so. Here, cannot be ignored the statement of Home Minister of Pakistan Mr. Chaudarī Nisār Ali khan, while he was replying to a question in the floor of National Assembly of Pakistan on minority's issue. He clearly said in the floor of Parliament, "According to the available record, provided from the provincial

governments of Pakistan till now (January 26, 2017) in majority of blasphemy cases the punishments was given to Muslims not to Minorities". <sup>50</sup>

A Christian opponent of the Blasphemy laws Dr. Theodor Gabriel also point outs this issue in his written discourse. He articulated likely;

"The Blasphemy laws by it are not malicious. Their purposes strengthen to religious foundation of society, by preventing conflict among religious groups and insuring their integrity and dignity and status of religious minorities. In a religious pluralistic situation the contingency of religious sensibilities is more on the religious majority than the minorities". <sup>51</sup>

Once in a TV show Mr. Mehūb Sada director Christian Study Centre, Rawalpindi also confess that till now Christian are not persecuted from this law. He replied a question on dismissal of Blasphemy law; "The minorities feel fear and unsafe in the presence of this law but it is also a fact that there is no proof of persecution of any Christian from courts due to this law from its foundation". 52 Then question can be raised why minorities' especially Christian leaders are demanding to repeal this important law? I think it is part of global anti blasphemy campaign which is run by some Christian leaders, secular Muslims and western NGOs. According to Allāma Amīn Shahīdī views, "The respect and dignity of the Prophet عليه is base of Muslim faith. So some culprits are try to defame the prophet dignity and hurting the hearts of billions of Muslims specially Muslims of Pakistan. With sorry to say I would like to say some Western institutes, NGOs and secular lobby are trying to raise this issue in Pakistan with heavy findings with the help of social media".53 Here, Dr. Mahmud Ghazi adds a beautiful comment on the law of blasphemy and criticism from the West. He articulated;

"The law of Tawhīn-i-Risālat (insulting prophet-hood) is merely to ensure legal protection to the Prophet's person. It is not a law of blasphemy in the sense we find in different Western countries, nor is it comparable with the laws governing heresy and blasphemy against religious people in medieval Europe, nor has it anything to do with the kind of inquisition we come across in post Muslim Spain. The law, in fact, aims at protecting the sanctity of the very source of guidance on which the entire legal, constitutional, social, and cultural edifice of Islam rests". 54

Although it is our ethical and moral duty, we must try to remove misconception of the west and minorities about this significant law. But it is a fact to repel or dismiss of this law is not so easy in Pakistan like countries because Muslims have heart feeling with it and feel that in this the dignity of the prophet is safe. Moreover, after its repealing and dismissing the minorities in Pakistan will become unsafe. Off course, we can review it and make it proper but cannot repeal or dismiss it. As well as, according to my

humble opinion we should promote the culture of respect, tolerance and harmony for each other. We should arrange some seminars and sessions to remove misconceptions and reservations of the minorities, especially, the Christian community regarding the Blasphemy law.

The other most controversial objection against this social cum interfaith movement of dialogue is that it promotes unification of the religions (Wahdatul-Advān)<sup>55</sup> .This is an identical and most controversial influence of this dialogue in Islamic Republic of Pakistan and local Muslim society. The Centre endorses the religious unification under the banner of interreligious dialogue which is most controversial and not acceptable for Muslin public and for the scholars and Ulama as well. A resource person of the CSC says under the title of Ommat-e wāhida (One Adherent), "We have to call and now see who are the people who repeal the creature of God from the evil, sectarianism, war and murder and to unite them in a string of peace, reconciliation, brotherhood and love and tell them the address of Ommat-e Wāhida (One Adherent)."56 The majority of Muslim scholars harshly and strongly protests against this objective and say this is a dangerous conspiracy against Islam and Pakistan. Dr. Naīm Mushtāq said, "This thought is very dangerous for Islam and Christianity both and sabotaging the actual Muslim-Christian dialogue movement in Pakistan."57

It is a much controversial thought, especially, in an ideological state as the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, where Islam is legally declared its state religion and it most dangerous for the future of Islam and Christianity both because no every single real flower of a community can adopt it. I think the basic cause of the ineffectiveness of the dialogue is that we do not discuss the religious issues between Muslim and Christian. We could not establish an environment of respect and tolerance between Muslims and Christians in Pakistan till now, because we leave the core issues and adopt the unnecessary and irrelevant issues. If we want to establish a fruitful and successful dialogue in Pakistan, we must revise the agenda and direction of this dialogue, because if we do not do this, it will be a failure for the dialogue. Therefore, some Muslim scholars have reservation towards this kind of dialogue, because they think there is no place of Islamic *Da'wah* in this activity. A renowned professor of Islamic studies in University of the Punjab, Lahore, at that point, Prof. Dr. Muhammad *Hammād Lakhvī* rightly observes;

"The very sad aspect of this dialogue for Muslims is that it is limiting, decreasing and sometimes harming of Islamic *Da'wah* in generally all over the world, especially, in Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Of course, we strongly agree to interfaith dialogue but disagree to these socio- political sittings and statements in the name of interfaith dialogue". <sup>58</sup>

To focus on cultural unity is another most important undesirable social influence of this dialogue. Keeping in view, promoting cultural unity is a basic

agenda of the Christian study center's dialogue. Their dialogue is not a religious dialogue but this is a social and cultural dialogue. As Jean-Lous Cardinal Touran the President of The Pontifical Council for Interreligious Dialogue said in a conference on interfaith dialogue at the CSC, "The Modern dialogue is not among religions but this is among followers of the different religions."<sup>59</sup> I participated in this important conference on interfaith dialogue. I keenly listened and observed that the full concentration of the honorable guests was on social aspect of dialogue in Pakistan. Another very important scholar of the CSC Dr. M. Aslam Khaki also writes in an article: "The purpose of interfaith dialogue is not to bring the faiths into harmony; rather it is to bring the followers of the faith into harmony."60 They want to unite the cultures according to the western, secular ad liberal culture. How it can be possible while the cultures represent various religions and values. Obviously, we can bring close the different cultures and minimize their conflicts but cannot unite them. These steps and events are seriously creating fallacies about this modern movement of interreligious dialogue in Muslim majority of Pakistan and this is not good for interreligious dialogue in Pakistani perspective. According to my humble opinion the cultural diversity is fruitful for Pakistani peace and property but there cannot be allowed vulgarity of western civilization on the cultural and social diversity and harmony. This sugar coated slogan, exercise and agenda basically leads the society towards secularism which against the Islamic identity of Pakistan. Muslims are not anti any minority our religions and constitution gives them all kinds of rights. Therefore, for that purpose we demand these rights for them and promote social tailrace in Islamic perspective rather than secular.

Moreover, another adverse social influence of this dialogue is a undesirable social change in Pakistani Muslim society. We may keenly observe the speakers and participants of dialogue and resource persons focus very much on western culture and western life style. They say for better development and good career opportunities this change (to blindly follow the western culture) is most essential in the society. Most of the time, they give priority to those persons whose ready to accept this change frequently. I am an eye witness to these activities in their interfaith dialogue programs. We see a group of Pakistani scholars and youth who like the western culture and hate the Islamic culture, in the name of unification of religions and harmony among different religions. It is not less than a dilemma in a legitimately decaled ideological Islamic state. Unnecessary legislation in Islamic Republic of Pakistan, especially in the political field, rather than social and religious affairs about minorities is a negative influence of the CSC's, dialogue in Pakistani Muslim society. For example, double vote system<sup>61</sup> and double seats of minorities because in this way they can blackmail the political parties in election. This system is only implemented in Pakistan, not even in the West and America. In this system, every minority voter can pole the vote to any

party one time and other time to his own minority member. Even for assembly members, some assembly members are elected indirectly and every member can be elected directly all over the Pakistan. This kind of legislation and value in an ideological Islamic state is not good for Muslims as majority and also for Christian community as minority. Thus, Dr. *Imtiaz Zafar* observes after practical involvement in this dialogue;

"The Pakistani minorities' especially Christian community gets unnecessary value due to their dual political value even some times they black male the political parties for their favorite legislation in Pakistan( I think it is not good for minorities itself)."

Here one thing is very interesting to share, due to this importance and international pressure some parties demand to make amendment in the constitution that some key posts cannot be granted to minorities. The chairman PPP  $Bal\bar{\alpha}wal\ Bhutto\ Zard\bar{\alpha}r\bar{\imath}$  has demanded this many a time.

Although, separate electoral system is a most important legislation for minorities in Pakistani socio-political and religious perspective but sometimes minorities use it for wrong purpose. This kind of change and impact is not suitable in an ideological Islamic state and even not for minorities because in this way a bad impression goes to Muslim majority. It creates silent violence in feelings of majority. Some special legislation for protection, welfare and protection of religious right can be moved to satisfy them.

Muslims scholars have their concerns towards interfaith dialogue for their missionary activities. Qāzī Mu'iz ud Din, a renowned name in interfaith dialogue in Pakistan said,

"He himself arranged many conferences and judged them thoroughly. He reached the conclusion that dialogue is a part of Christian missions and in Pakistan those churches and Christians are working for their cause and received funds from the foreign countries. These people make a hole in the boat in which they are voyaging". 63

Most of the dialogical activities in Muslim countries increase the Christian's missionary activities and source to increase Christian influence and strength. One of the important examples is Pakistan, where they promote dialogue. A renowned Pakistani Christian dialogue expert Fr. James Channan says about its importance as, "There is a need to help our people realize that a dialogue with Muslims is must in Pakistan. There is no future for the church in Pakistan without dialogue". 64

According to an alarming statement of an International research journal *Missiology*, "Dialogue in its very nature is a missionary activity. It is, to Catholic Church a means to expand the mission of Christ and lead the people to eternal salvation by converting them to Christianity." The strong statement and appreciation of Pop Johan Paul for interfaith dialogue for

missions is also a reason of Muslims' concern for dialogue. He said in a conference, "I am glad to see the active participation of Franciscan community in interreligious dialogue with a new spirit because this dialogue is an important part of the Church mission for the Universalization of Christianity". 66

Due to these reasons Muslim scholars have been coming to show their concerns and reservations on modern moment of interfaith dialogue, for its methodology, issues, status and future. Prof. Dr. Khalid Alvī, a well-known Pakistani scholar said, "It is a new tactic, which is used to confuse the Muslims in interreligious dialogue. In diplomatic language, it is called engagement". Therefore, these kinds of reservations compel us to rethink about the modern interfaith dialogue movement. It is the duty of the representatives of this dialogue to give suitable answer to these questions. I think meaningful dialogue is need of Muslim and Christian community but the present dialogue is not fulfilling that criterion. Therefore, we should revise its approaches, methodology and direction then it can become fruitful for Pakistan and as well as international level. Here, I completely agree to Dr. Muhammad *Modassir* Ali beautiful suggestion about dialogue;

"If we want to establish a fruitful dialogue between Muslim and Christian Communities of Pakistan then we should completely revise the present direction, strategy, issues and approaches of this dialogue because it does not match with the temperament and interests of Pakistani Muslims society." <sup>68</sup>

#### **CONCLUSION:**

It is observed from the above study that the Christian Study Centre's dialogue has particular undesirable influence on the Muslim society of Pakistan, especially, in a legally announced and declared Islamic Republic of Pakistan. These impacts are: unification of religions, promotion of secular, liberal and western culture, propaganda against Islamic identity of Pakistan, demotion of Shrī'ah laws and especially an active campaign against Blasphemy Act of the Constitution of 1973 on the behalf of secular lobby of Pakistan, international community and NGOs. So it is perceived from its impacts sometimes this interfaith dialogue exceeds its limits and creates some kind of problems for Muslim socio-religious norms of Pakistan. Thus, Muslim scholars show their reservations to this dialogue from its beginning.

The political involvement in this dialogue also damages the status and direction of this dialogue. As well as it is perceived from the above discussion Christian are so font of this activity where they are in minority because actually this is a missionary activity and create hurdles and obstacles in the way of Islamic Da'wah because the Muslim priority to contribute this dialogue is Da'wah, knowledge and understanding of others not photo session only. Therefore, it is recommended and suggested on the behalf of this study that if we need to manage a fruitful, dialogue between Muslims and Christian faiths

of the Islamic republic of Pakistan, which is the dire need of time then we must revise its aims, objectives, approaches, dimensions and even issues with wider consultation of the recognized Pakistan Muslim-Christian creditable scholars. Otherwise, this activity is not more than an academic and mental exercise in the name of interfaith dialogue.

#### References

John L. Esposito (ed.), The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Islamic World (Oxford

University Press, 2009),182.

Esposito, The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Islamic World, 183.

<sup>3</sup> Karaan, J. D, "Muslim-Christian Relations and Christian Study Centers", al-Mushīr 26:3-

4 (1984),173.

Jacques Levrat, Une Expeérience deDilaogue.les centers d'Etude Chrétens en pays

Musulmans, Thése de (Doctrat présentée a la Faculte de Theologie, 1984), 6.

Ecumenical Centre: A center which works beyond the division of Christian churches. In

this center all famous Christian sects (Catholics, Orthodox and Protestant) works together for their collective cause focus on interfaith dialogue, harmony and peace building.

6 **HMI**: Henry Martyn Institute of Islamic Studies Hyderabad, India is a prominent

Christian institute on interfaith dialogue, harmony and reconciliation. It was establishes in Lahore in 1930. After its shifting to Hyderabad India CSC, Rawalpindi is considered as its extension in Pakistan.

- Mehbūb, Sadā, "Culture of Peace", Ham Qadam: A News Letter, 2:2 (2006): 5-8.
- Sadā, Mehbūb (ed), Mukālma-e-Aman( Dialogue of Peace)( Rawalpindi: CSC,2006),7.
- Yusuf Jalīl, In search of understanding and cooperation, al-Mushīr 16:4-6 (1974): 88-104.

### Impact of Interfaith Dialogue on Pakistani Society

- Broacher of the Christian Study Centre, Rawalpindi, (Rawalpindi: CSC, 2005), 7.
- E-mail Respond, Maulāna Maqsūd Salfi:peacefoundation\_1@yahoo.com (Peshawar: 13/09/2010).
- <sup>12</sup> Interview: Mr. Mehbūb Sadā, (Rawalpindi: CSC, 16/8/2010).
- Interview, Qāzī Abdul Qadīr Khāmosh (Lahore: MCFI, 28/7/2010).
- Mughal, Dominic J. (ed.), Sadā, Mehbūb and Bashīr Romāna, True stories of joyful
  - co-existence (Rawalpindi : CSC,2004), 13-16.
- Mughal, True stories of joyful co-existence, 13-16.
- Mehbūb ,Sadā, Dialogue of Peace (Rawalpindi: CSC,2006),7.
- Sadā, Mukālma-e-Aman, 1.
- Mughal, Dominic J., Sadā, Mehbûb and Basher, Romāna, Interfaith and Social harmony on publiclevel (Rawalpindi: CSC, 2001), 7.
- <sup>19</sup> Romāna, Dāemī Aman kī Ālamgīrīyyat, 4.
- Shantī Nagger: Some years before some people burnt fired the houses of Christians and Christians also same responded to Muslims. It is seen mostly these incidents as a result of misconception or conspiracy.
- Sadā, Ham Qadam ,12.
- Interview: Pr. Sayyīd Izhār Bukhāīr (Rawalpindi: JMML, 20/07/2010).
- Interview, Mr. Mehbūb Sadā (Rawalpindi:7/6/2010).
- Mukālma-e-Aman, 11.
- Domenic J, Our Hearts beat the same song, 45-49.
- Riaz, Muslim-Christian Dialogue in Pakistan: A Case Study of the CSC, 140.
- Mother Teresa: Mother Teresa was a Christian Nun and did preaching of

#### Christianity

under the umbrella of human welfare. As a point of objection, he can name this school also on Muslim leader because school was in Muslim populated area but due to their missionary nature they think and do so.

- Domenic J, Our Hearts beat the Same song, 58-61.
- COSAP: It stands for Christians Organizations of Social Action in Pakistan.

  It was

alliance of six Christian organization, they worked for separate electoral system in Pakistan in 2012.

- Interview, Mr. Mehbūb Sadā (Rawalpindi: CSC, 16/8/2010).
- Annual Report of CSC 1997, 27.
- Interview, Qāzī Abdul Qadīr Khāmūsh, (Lahore: MCFI,28/7/2010)/
- Riaz, Muslim-Christian Dialogue in Pakistan: A Case Study of CSC, 148.
- James, Channan, Christian- Muslim dialogue in Pakistan (Lahore: National Commission
  - for Christian Muslim Relations Pakistan, 1995),128.
- <sup>35</sup> Brog, Schantz, "Islam in Europe", Missiology, 21:4 (1993):443-456.
- Mebūb, Dialogue of Peace, 95.
- Sadā, Mukālma-e-Aman, 1.
- Mughal, Dominic, J."From dialogue of mind to dialogue of hearts", al-Mushīr, 40:1 (1998): pp.13-23.
- Interview: Dr. Imtiāz Zafar (Islamabad: Dāwah Academy, IIU, 13/7/2010).
- Annual Report of CSC 1998, (Rawalpindi: CSC, 1999),9.
- Gabriel, Theodor, Christian Citizen in an Islamic state (London: Ashgate Publishing, 2013), 96.
- Interview, Prof. Qāzī Ziā-ul-Haq (Rawalpindi : GCS /20/7/2010).
- Blasphemy Act: According to constitution of Pakistan, 1973, Clause 295-C, if any

person blaspheme the Prophet Muhammad مطواله or any other Prophet or divine Book. He will be death punished by court.

### Impact of Interfaith Dialogue on Pakistani Society

- Sadā, Ham Qadam, 3.
- http://www.bbc.co.uk/urdu/pakistan /blasphemy\_law\_taseer.shtml/Accesed: 19/11/2010/.
- Mir, Shakīl ur-Rehmān, Daily Jang News, Rawalpindi /15/11/10/.
- http://www.bbc.co.uk/urdu/pakistan/blasphemy\_law.shtml (Accessed: 19/11/2010).
- Fārūqī, Moulāna, Abdul Raoūf, Mukālma Bayn-al-Mazāhib, 3:9 (2009):1-6.
- Interview: Maulāna Abdulraūf Fārūqī, (Lahore: MBM, 25/7/2010).
- http://www.bbc.com/urdu/pakistan-38768336/Accessed: 27/1/17/
- Theodor, Christian Citizen in an Islamic state: The Pakistani Experience, 103
- Qureshī, Muhammad Ismail, Qānūn Touhīne-Resālat main Tarmīm , Mahnāma
  - Mohaddis37:1(2005):25-30.
- https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SKeVqkMCHiY/Accessed; 3/2/17
- http://www.ips.org.pk/society-and-culture/1409-the-law-of-tawhin-i-risalat/Accessed:6/2/17/
- (Wahdatul-Adyān): It means unification of different religions. Some people on

international level try to merge different religions as a one religion. They said we should collect positive things like ethics from different religions and name it as a one religion. It's like Dīn-e-Akbarī and impossible to bear it for Muslims.

- Romāna, Dāemī Aman kī Ālamgīrīyyat, 67.
- Interview, Dr. Naīm Mushtāq (Islamabad: Islamabad Club, 20/7/10).
- Interview, Prof. Dr. Muhammad Hammād Lakhvī, (Lahore: University of the Punjab /21/2/2011)
- Cardinal Touran, "Interfaith dialogue in a pluralistic society" (Rawalpindi: CSC, 26/11/10).

- Sadā, Mukālma-e-Aman, 35.
- Dual right of vote: According to this system minorities have some special Quota in
  - local, provincial and national assembly of Pakistan. As well as they have right of vote and right of election in any constituency.
- Riaz, Muslim-Christian Dialogue in Pakistan: A Case Study of the CSC, 149.
- Shāhid, Religious Dialogue between Muslims and Christians of Pakistan, 139.
- James, Channan, Christian-Muslim Dialogue in Pakistan (Lahore: NCCMR, 1995), 128.
- <sup>65</sup> Brog, Schantz, "Islam in Europe", Missiology, 21:4 (1993):443-456.
- Safīr Akhtar, "'Ulamā e Baarīsaghīr aur Mutāla Masīhīyyat", 'Ālame Islam aur 'Esāyat 5:1 (1995):16-19.
- Alvī, Dr. Khalid, "Mukālma Bain al-Madhāhib", Monthly Dawah 11:2 (2005):21-36.
- Interview: Dr. Muhammad Modassir Ali (Islamabad: International Islamic University; 30/9/15).